



Bu proje Avrupa Birliđi ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.
This project is co-funded by the European Union and the Republic of Turkey.

3RP Consultation with Local and National Civil Society for Türkiye Country Chapter 2023-2025 Desktop review

November 2022

Prepared by:
Souad Usayran



This publication was produced with the financial support of the European Union. Its contents are the sole responsibility of The Research Centre on Asylum and Migration and Refugee Council of Turkey and do not necessarily reflect the views of the European Union.

Introduction

The Regional Refugee and Resilience Plan (3RP) has resulted in multi-level programs involving various stakeholders and sectors. It provides a regional response framework together with its partners and allows for the country-specific interventions in the countries hosting large number of refugees.

The 3RP in Türkiye is co-led by UNDP and UNHCR and works with 74 national and international partners. Currently, a consultation process is underway to help and develop the 3RP plan and strategy for 2023-2025.

The Refugee Council of Turkey (TMK) has been engaged with the 3RP consultation processes for the last two years. This year TMK and the Localization Advocacy Group (LAG) has jointly launched a comprehensive consultation process in coordination with UNDP and UNHCR to ensure voices of the civil society organizations, including refugee-led organizations, are widely represented, and they meaningfully contribute to priority setting and plans of the 3RP strategy for the 2023-2025,

To this end, the TMK and LAG has launched a survey to which 77 civil society organizations have responded. Additionally, 6 focus group discussions were held with 25 organizations, including organizations working with children, youth, women and LGBTQI+. And finally, a desk review of over 20 needs assessments and reports of civil society organisations from the last two years was carried out in order to tap into the rich knowledge that exists on priorities of refugee communities in Türkiye, their challenges and opportunities, and the recommendations provided based on field experience.

This current report presents a snapshot of all reports and needs assessments reviewed, indicating the current situation for different sectors covered in the 3RP and synthesizing key recommendations for various sectors, including the intersectoral issues. The desk-top review focused on reports and assessments done between 2020-2022. It aims to highlight priorities and recommendations made by diverse actors in the field based on evidence and research to seize upon the existing work of civil society, appreciate, acknowledge and highlight their efforts. The results of the survey and focus group discussions that were conducted by TMK and LAG are presented in a separate report, accompanying the current one.

Most resources under review include focus on specific segments of refugee populations which face additional vulnerabilities or marginalization such as youth, child laborers, seasonal agricultural laborers, refugees living with disability, LGBTQI+ refugees among others. The recommendations are organized to address different actors from national institutions, International Non-Governmental Organizations (INGOs), (national) Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs) or Civil Society Organizations (CSOs),¹ local actors such as municipalities. Across sectors, there is specific emphasis on addressing the needs of certain groups such as women, youth, LGBTIQ+ refugees, among others who may experience additional vulnerabilities rather than presenting a comprehensive overview of all reports published on refugee concerns.

Across reports and need assessments, specific intersecting cross-sectoral issues emerge. Legal frameworks influence all aspects of refugees' lives from their access to healthcare, education, livelihood and social security. It is necessary for GoT to amend national legislation and regulation concerning migration to ensure the right to asylum for all and to protect refugees under Temporary

¹ In the following NGOs and CSOs will be used interchangeably.

Protection (TP) and asylum seekers and conditional refugees under International Protection (IP).² A key aspect of providing protection to refugees, whether under IP or TP, requires that the Government of Türkiye (GoT) upholds the principle of non-refoulement for all refugees and asylum seekers.³ Providing protection to refugees necessitates ensuring their access to registration and asylum processes in a timely manner. Without addressing these protection issues, refugees and asylum seekers will face persistent uncertainty about their status and presence in Türkiye.⁴

Various reports emphasize the need to support multi-dimensional institutional adaptability, flexibility, openness and learning to better address all refugee communities' needs but also specific segments of refugee communities, including but not limited to refugees with disability, nomadic/semi-nomadic refugees working as agricultural laborers, LGBTIQ+ refugees, child laborers among others. Strengthening institutions must also be approached as multi-directional with institutions ranging from local or refugee-led NGOs to national and international ones sharing experiences and good practices with each other and with local municipalities or state institutions. Given the complexity of issues facing specific segments of refugee populations, bottom-up or horizontal sharing of expertise may be more effective in addressing refugees' needs than top-down approaches. Capacity development and policy formulation must rely on comprehensive research and needs assessments that identify gaps, persistent needs and vulnerabilities.⁵

Despite many NGOs' efforts to provide guidance and information to refugees about legal issues, service provision and the like, the need to increase or establish information centers addressing different refugee groups' information needs persists. Further research is needed to identify good practices that can be implemented.

The persistence of language barriers is also emphasized by different reports identifying the necessity of increasing the availability of translation and interpretation services in multiple languages (e.g. Arabic, Farsi, Dari, Pashtu, etc.) are provided in different institutions. Alongside these is the consistent recommendation to increase the availability of Turkish language courses and facilitating access to courses for different segments of refugee populations by providing transportation, covering costs or childcare options among others.

While cash assistance programs have been in operation for several years, the worsening economic situation and negative impact of the Covid-19 pandemic (e.g. loss of income or jobs, etc.), increasing the cash assistance and diversifying the types of support offered to refugee communities is

² In the following Syrian persons under Temporary Protection will be referred to as Syrian refugees though Temporary Protection does not grant them 'refugee' status based on the legal definition for refugee outlined in the LFIP.

³ Aylin Kırıkçı, Ercan Aydın, Selçuk Çelik, Süleyman Sayar & Müzeyyen Araç, Report on Right to Health for LGBTIQ+ Refugees and Discrimination, (HEVI LGBTIQ+ Association, April 2021). As highlighted in the report, Article 69 of the Law on Foreigners and International Protection makes it possible for state actors to deport any foreigner considered a risk to public health.

⁴ Refugee Council of Türkiye (TMK), 'Gender and Migration Working Group Meeting notes, (Internal, April 2022); Zakire Hekmat, "Zorunlu Göç Farkındalığının Artırılması (FARK) Savunculuk Raporu," (TMK, ARSA, Hayata Destek, 2022). The report relies on focus group discussions conducted in Istanbul, Konya and Kayseri with 31 Afghan refugees in total and interviews with 6 Afghan refugees in the same cities in 2022.

⁵ Fulya Memişoğlu, Altan Özkil & Tuna Kılınç, Protection Needs of Refugees with Disability, (İGAM, ARSA, SMDD, 2021). The report is based on the outputs of the 'Protection Needs of Refugees with Disability in Turkey' project. Qualitative and quantitative research was undertaken between July-September 2021 in Ankara, Kayseri and İzmir with 300 refugee participants from different nationalities including: Syrian, Afghan, Iranian and Iraqi. Güneş A. Aşık, "Analysis of Measures to Increase the Labor Force Participation of Refugee and Turkish Women in Turkey, (TMK, March 2022). The report presents an analysis of existing literature concerning the labor integration of Syrian refugee women and reviews publicly available quantitative data on Syrian and citizen women's labor participation.

mentioned in several reports and needs assessments. Ensuring that refugee communities' basic needs are met can contribute to reducing reliance on negative coping strategies such as debt, changes in diet, child labor or early forced marriage among other strategies.

Across reports and needs assessments, discrimination and xenophobia emerge as crucial issues that require a comprehensive, multi-level and coordinated approach to be implemented by all actors. This approach must be developed to address the wide -ranging social discrimination and anti-refugee sentiments as well as the institutional discrimination. Countering negative attitudes and perceptions against refugees will require long-term efforts given the increased polarization and politicization of the migration issue.

Access to Protection

The Law on Foreigners and International Protection (LFIP) is the key document outlining right to asylum and protection in the context in Türkiye, The Temporary Protection Regulation outlines the rights and obligations of persons under Temporary Protection. Since the LFIP came into effect in 2014, Türkiye has witnessed several changes regarding processing and procedures. Since 2018, the Presidency for Migration Management (PMM) took over the⁶ responsibility of processing refugee status determination (RSD). Asylum applicants applying for International Protection (IP) are assigned to satellite cities where their applications are assessed. Applicants are expected to remain in these satellite cities until a final decision on their asylum application is made. For moving between provinces, asylum seekers need to apply for permissions from Provincial Directorates for Migration Management (PDMMs). Recent years have witnessed several changes in registration processes for Syrian refugees influencing access to services and mobility within Türkiye. Syrian refugees' access to services is tied to their province of initial registration. It is possible to move registration, but several provinces have halted this process except for specific cases (e.g. moving for education, employment contract or marriage). Despite these restrictions, many refugees are living in provinces other than that of their initial registration, putting them in a vulnerable position for a possible administrative action.

Based on current figures, almost 30,000 applications for IP were made in 2021.⁷ According to UNHCR figures, there are almost 300,000 asylum seekers in Türkiye.⁸ Syrian refugees registered under TP number over 3.6 million persons registered in provinces across Türkiye.⁹ With respect to resettlement, according to UNHCR 11,803 refugees' cases were submitted for consideration for resettlement as of September 30, 2022¹⁰

Several CSOs are working to support refugees' access to protection through advocacy with PMM or other state institutions as relevant, provide legal information and conduct case follow up among other services. The research done on this issue, and work in the field resulted in development of several recommendations in access to protection. Some of these recommendations are as follows:

- PMM in collaboration with relevant ministries, UN agencies, national/local and refugee-led civil society organizations and INGOs to advance and refine protection mechanisms for different segments of the refugee population including women, children, persons living with

⁶ The TPR was issued in 2014 and the most recent amendments were made to the TRP in 2019.

⁷ PMM, International Protection Statistics, (PMM, 2021).

⁸ UNHCR, Türkiye Fact Sheet, (UNHCR, September 2022).

⁹ PMM Statistics, Temporary Protection, (PMM, 20.10.2022).

¹⁰ UNHCR, Türkiye Fact Sheet, (UNHCR, September 2022).

disability and LGBTIQ+ persons. CSOs and donors lobby with GoT and the Ministry of Internal Affairs to implement legislation on the protection of women and to reduce gender-based violence.¹¹

- PMM to increase access to registration for all refugee groups and reduce processing times given the impact of registration on access to health, education, and social support. CSOs to support refugees to register as well as raise awareness about legal implications of registration (or lack thereof).¹²
- Local organizations to develop platforms or channels or activate existing ones to increase access to legal support, legal information to address misconceptions about rights and legal procedures¹³

Gender

Gender and age are key factors affecting various aspects of refugees' experiences of forced migration. Various efforts have been launched taking into consideration needs and additional vulnerabilities of women and girl refugees specifically such as Women and Girls Safe Spaces, or vocational trainings to support refugee women's transition into the labor market. Despite these efforts, research indicates that further work is needed on the following fields:

- Despite NGOs' efforts to increase information availability, research demonstrates the need to increase information concerning protection and legal rights to empower refugee and host community women remains.¹⁴ It is necessary to support and increase awareness raising about gender-based violence and mechanisms to seek protection. It is also necessary to continue to raise awareness about the dangers of early and forced marriage to girls' health and well-being¹⁵
- CSOs to undertake sensitization for men, women, youth, and children on women's changing roles to cement social acceptance for economic participation, education acquisition and women in leadership roles¹⁶

¹¹ Güneş A. Aşık, "Analysis of Measures to Increase the Labor Force Participation of Refugee and Turkish Women in Turkey, (TMK, March 2022); Fulya Memişoğlu, Altan Özkil & Tuna Kılınc, Protection Needs of Refugees with Disability, (İGAM, ARSA, SMDD, 2021).

¹² Deniz Bozkuzu & Yusuf Nural, "Protection Monitoring Report II on Refugees Engaged in Seasonal Agricultural Labor in Gaziantep, Şanlıurfa, Adana and Mersin," (GOAL, August 2021).

¹³ Zakire Hekmat, "Zorunlu Göç Farkındalığının Artırılması (FARK) Savunculuk Raporu," (TMK, ARSA, Hayata Destek, 2022); Deniz Bozkuzu & Yusuf Nural, "Protection Monitoring Report II on Refugees Engaged in Seasonal Agricultural Labor in Gaziantep, Şanlıurfa, Adana and Mersin," (GOAL, August 2021).

¹⁴ IOM, "Needs Assessment Report on Women Empowerment in Adana and Gaziantep," (IOM, February 2022). The IOM needs assessment findings are based on mixed methods research undertaken with Syrian and host community women in Gaziantep and Adana. For the report, 14 key informant interviews were undertaken with I/NGOs in Adana and Gaziantep and quantitative online survey was conducted with host and refugee women in the two provinces (306 responses in total). Refugee women who participated in the study were from different nationalities: Syrian, Iraqi, Afghan and Iranian and held different statuses in Turkey.

¹⁵ Gülbahar Canadan Evcil, "2022 Yılı I. 6 Aylık Kadın Danışma Merkezi Raporu," (Mardin Ortak Kadın İşbirliği Derneği, July 2022). The report reviews the activities and situation of the women's center presenting the situation of citizen and refugee women and girls living in Artuklu, Mardin with a focus on various forms of violence experienced. Güneş A. Aşık, "Analysis of Measures to Increase the Labor Force Participation of Refugee and Turkish Women in Turkey, (TMK, March 2022); Deniz Bozkuzu & Yusuf Nural, "Protection Monitoring Report II on Refugees Engaged in Seasonal Agricultural Labor in Gaziantep, Şanlıurfa, Adana and Mersin," (GOAL, August 2021).

¹⁶ GK Consulting & CARE, "Syrian Refugee Women's Roles," (CARE, February 2020). The report relies on qualitative research using a participatory ethnographic approach undertaken with 54 refugee women in Lebanon, Jordan and Turkey in 2020 to explore women's changing roles due to the conflict and forced migration. Güneş A. Aşık, "Analysis of Measures to Increase the Labor Force Participation of Refugee and Turkish Women in Turkey, (TMK, March 2022).

- Adopt role model approach to increase refugee women’s role and participation in social life; male and female community leaders can play a significant role here;¹⁷ promoting women role-models among refugees will help in expanding the horizons of girls and their views on the options that might be available to them.¹⁸

Children

With respect to children, access to school, addressing child labor and early child marriage / forced marriage are intersectoral issues of concern for different actors. There is also a growing need to address issues and concerns of children living with disabilities and special needs. Based on existing reports the following are specific areas which require further efforts:

- GoT to activate ‘Anti-Child Labor Units’ established in 2019 in different Turkish provinces to fight against child labor. NGOs, CSOs and other actors working to fight child labor must collaborate and cooperate to strengthen efforts. Existing legislation and regulation to fight child labor must be implemented.¹⁹
- It is necessary to increase available social support and parents/caregivers’ integration into labor market to reduce dependence on child labor. Realizing this recommendation requires multi-level and complementary action. Unless families secure their basic needs, child labor will remain a frequently relied on coping strategy.
- The perspective of child workers must be incorporated into research and relied on in awareness raising activities. Without properly situating their perspective and a willingness to address the structural inequalities that result in their entrance into the labor market, projects to reduce child labor will remain ineffective.²⁰

Accessing Education

Accessing Schools

Since 2016, Ministry of National Education (MoNE) moved to close Temporary Education Centers and transition Syrian refugee students into public, or private, schools. According to latest figures from MoNE, over 850,000 students under TP and IP are registered into Turkish schools as of December 2021.²¹ The review of existing research indicates that despite of the impressive number of students integrated into the national education system, persistent obstacles for accessing education is a reality for some of the refugee children. For example, in a focus group discussion with a group of Afghan refugees the lack of knowledge on registration processes and bureaucratic barriers were highlighted as impediments to accessing education. For non-Syrian refugees and migrants, access to education depends on their registration and having a foreign identity number (starting with 99). Syrian refugees under TP and non-Syrian asylum seekers can access education only in the province of their registration. Due to this, children of families that move to provinces other than their province of registration are excluded from accessing education. Conditional Cash Transfer for Education (CCTE)

¹⁷ Zakire Hekmat, “Zorunlu Göç Farkındalığının Artırılması (FARK) Savunculuk Raporu,” (TMK, ARSA, Hayata Destek, 2022).

¹⁸ GK Consulting & CARE, “Syrian Refugee Women’s Roles,” (CARE, February 2020).

¹⁹ Ayşegül Kayağgü, “Gender-Sensitive Study on Urban Child Labor in İstanbul, (Save the Children, February 2021). The report is based on quantitative and qualitative research undertaken with Turkish, Syrian and Roma communities in İstanbul in Gaziosmanpaşa, Kağıthane and Şişli focusing on child labor. Interviews were conducted with child laborers, parents/caregivers, employers, social workers among others. A total of 429 children and 148 adults participated in the research.

²⁰ Ayşegül Kayağgü, “Gender-Sensitive Study on Urban Child Labor in İstanbul, (Save the Children, February 2021).

²¹ HBOGM, “İzleme ve Değerlendirme Raporu 2021,” (MEB, 2022).

scheme continues providing families with school age children with additional support. According to figures from August 2022, 803,697 children are registered as part of the scheme.²² The scheme aims to promote children's continued education, reduce drop out due to financial difficulties and negative coping strategies such as child labor or early marriage.

Existing research also highlights continued problems of discrimination and bullying which negatively affect refugee and asylum seekers' experiences in schools. While elementary school registration and retention is considered high, middle school and high school witness a higher drop-out rate among refugee children and youth. Refugees with special needs face additional difficulties and barriers to access education. In 2019, it became possible for refugee students to access special education centers, but registration in centers remains low.

A number of research carried out by various civil society organizations indicate that the following areas will need a further attention of the MoNE, civil society and other institutions for increasing access to and quality of education. The issues are organized around three pillars, access to education, quality of education and retention.

Various research indicates the following as areas requiring further efforts:

- MoNE in collaboration with PMM must ensure that all refugee children can be registered in school and complete their education regardless of their registration status.²³ Ensuring access to education requires a multi-level approach based on changes to registration regulation and practices, raising awareness about refugees' rights to education among educators and school administrators as well as raising awareness among refugee populations concerning the importance of schooling.²⁴
- Student retention is a key concern especially for refugee students at middle and high school level. MoNE in collaboration with CSOs to develop teacher and education staff capacities to work with diverse groups and foster multi-cultural and inclusive school environments that uphold gender equality. It is necessary to consider amending national curriculum to reflect these principles. MoNE to consider integrating the school social work system into existing school guidance and psychological counseling services to facilitate the early identification of children at risk of dropping out and support timely interventions. MoNE to implement zero-tolerance bullying and discrimination policies in schools may contribute to student retention.²⁵

²² UNICEF, "Conditional Cash Transfer for Education (CCTE) Programme for Syrians and Other Refugees, August Factsheet" (UNICEF, August 2022).

²³ Refugee Council of Turkey, "Access to Education Report" (TKM, 2022). The report represents a comprehensive overview of the access to education for different refugee groups in Turkey identifying cross-sectional and persistent challenges and limitations; Serhat Çelik, "Understanding School Dropouts Among Refugee Children: Barriers, Challenges and Opportunities in the Case of Esenyurt, Istanbul, (Save the Children, January 2022); Zakire Hekmat, "Zorunlu Göç Farkındalığının Artırılması (FARK) Savunculuk Raporu," (TMK, ARSA, Hayata Destek, 2022).

²⁴ Refugee Council of Turkey, "Access to Education Report" (TKM, March 2022); Zakire Hekmat, "Zorunlu Göç Farkındalığının Artırılması (FARK) Savunculuk Raporu," (TMK, ARSA, Hayata Destek, 2022); Deniz Bozkuzu & Yusuf Nural, "Protection Monitoring Report II on Refugees Engaged in Seasonal Agricultural Labor in Gaziantep, Şanlıurfa, Adana and Mersin," (GOAL, August 2021).

²⁵ Serhat Çelik, "Understanding School Dropouts Among Refugee Children: Barriers, Challenges and Opportunities in the Case of Esenyurt, Istanbul, (Save the Children, January 2022); SENED, "Protection and Education Needs of Refugees with Disabilities in Southeast Turkey," (SENEDE, 2022). The SENED research involved face-to-face interviews conducted with 794 Syrian and non-Syrian caregivers of refugee children with disability living in Gaziantep, Kilis and Şanlıurfa in December 2021. Güneş A. Aşık, "Analysis of Measures to Increase the Labor Force Participation of Refugee and Turkish Women in Turkey, (TMK, March 2022); Nehir Gündoğdu, Fatma Çşkun Caymaz, Zühal Geziçier & Kemal Vural Tarlan, "Being educated is a distant dream to us.' Dom and Abdal Children's Education in Turkey: The Cases of Gaziantep and Şanlıurfa," (Kırıkayak Kültür,

- It is necessary for MoNE to increase the number of special education centers or strengthen capacities of existing special education centers through training and hiring to meet refugee student needs. MoNE may extend the same practices followed for citizen children to refugee children with special needs to ensure free access to special education centers and rehabilitation centers. Ensuring sufficient language support in Arabic and Farsi in centers is made available to children and parents is key.²⁶
- Supporting refugee families to avoid relying on negative coping strategies such as child labor, school drop-out and early forced marriage. This includes integrating caregivers of out-of-school children into livelihood programs as possible, strengthening cash-based programs for refugee households and extending them to cover the cost of transportation to school and cost of education materials. It is also important to understand why certain segments of the refugee population prefer their children to remain out of school rather than solely relying on ‘negative coping strategies’ as the framework for analysis.²⁷
- NGOs and Provincial Directorates of National Education to develop and organize catch-up programs for children with irregular school attendance due to household seasonal migration, educational gaps or students starting school without knowledge of Turkish language.²⁸
- MoNE and NGOs to increase the digital literacy of refugee children (including those with special needs) and their access to online and remote learning options by instituting provisions for supervised computer use in schools to support access after school hours. NGOs or local actors and community centers may set up study spaces with access to computers to support study and digital literacy. Local and municipal actors may contribute by increasing internet accessibility through free hotspots due to rising internet costs.²⁹
- Multi-level approach to reducing discrimination and increasing retention in schools including involving parents/caregivers in school activities and supporting refugee parents’ involvement by providing translation during school events/activities, establishing joint parent committees, setting up mentorship and buddy support programs as well as address wider societal issues concerning discrimination and xenophobia³⁰

August 2020). Qualitative research was conducted with Dom and Abdal refugee families and schools in key districts where they are living in Gaziantep and Şanlıurfa in November 2019.

²⁶ Refugee Council of Turkey, “Access to Education Report,” (TKM, March 2022); Fulya Memişoğlu, Altan Özkil & Tuna Kılınc, Protection Needs of Refugees with Disability, (İGAM, ARSA, SMDD, 2021); SENED, “Protection and Education Needs of Refugees with Disabilities in Southeast Turkey,” (SENEDE, 2022).

²⁷ Refugee Council of Turkey, “Access to Education Report,” (TKM, March 2022); Serhat Çelik, “Understanding School Dropouts Among Refugee Children: Barriers, Challenges and Opportunities in the Case of Esenyurt, Istanbul, (Save the Children, January 2022); Zakire Hekmat, “Zorunlu Göç Farkındalığının Artırılması (FARK) Savunculuk Raporu,” (TKM, ARSA, Hayata Destek, 2022); Deniz Bozkuzu & Yusuf Nural, “Protection Monitoring Report II on Refugees Engaged in Seasonal Agricultural Labor in Gaziantep, Şanlıurfa, Adana and Mersin,” (GOAL, August 2021); Nehir Gündoğdu, Fatma Coşkun Caymaz, Zühal Gezici & Kemal Vural Tarlan, “‘Being educated is a distant dream to us.’ Dom and Abdal Children’s Education in Turkey: The Cases of Gaziantep and Şanlıurfa,” (Kırıkayak Kültür, August 2020).

²⁸ Zakire Hekmat, “Zorunlu Göç Farkındalığının Artırılması (FARK) Savunculuk Raporu,” (TKM, ARSA, Hayata Destek, 2022); Deniz Bozkuzu & Yusuf Nural, “Protection Monitoring Report II on Refugees Engaged in Seasonal Agricultural Labor in Gaziantep, Şanlıurfa, Adana and Mersin,” (GOAL, August; Nehir Gündoğdu, Fatma Coşkun Caymaz, Zühal Gezici & Kemal Vural Tarlan, “‘Being educated is a distant dream to us.’ Dom and Abdal Children’s Education in Turkey: The Cases of Gaziantep and Şanlıurfa,” (Kırıkayak Kültür, August 2020).

²⁹ Refugee Council of Turkey, “Access to Education Report,” (TKM, March 2022); SENED, “Protection and Education Needs of Refugees with Disabilities in Southeast Turkey,” (SENEDE, 2022).

³⁰ Refugee Council of Turkey, “Access to Education Report,” (TKM, March 2022); Serhat Çelik, “Understanding School Dropouts Among Refugee Children: Barriers, Challenges and Opportunities in the Case of Esenyurt, Istanbul, (Save the Children, January 2022).

Accessing Higher Education

With respect to access to Higher Education (HE), GoT implemented different regulations over time to facilitate Syrian refugees access to HE. In 2019, the GoT amended regulations whereby Syrian refugees under Temporary Protection entering university are expected to pay fees the same as international students. Non-Syrian refugees seeking to enter HE have always been treated as international students. Research with refugee youth in Istanbul highlights that this change places a financial burden on Syrian refugees seeking to continue into higher education.³¹ GoT, donors, UN agencies and INGOs supported financial scholarship programs (e.g. Türkiye Burslari, DAFI scholarship, SPARK, etc.) to provide Syrian and non-Syrian refugees with opportunities to continue their higher education in Türkiye.

Existing research with refugee youth with respect to access to HE highlights the following:

- Various actors must continue to provide scholarships targeting refugee populations to facilitate access to HE. Specific funding must be dedicated to support refugees with disabilities with transportation and other costs to attend higher education (e.g. special equipment, covering expenses of companions, etc.)³²
- Diverse activities to raise awareness about the right to asylum. It is also necessary to design and implement different social cohesion activities among university students to address discrimination and xenophobia³³

Accessing Health

Refugee health and access to healthcare services is a public health issue. Syrian refugees under Temporary Protection have access to healthcare for free to the extent covered by the general health insurance provisions in the province of their registration. For refugees and asylum seekers applying for IP, they are covered by the general health Insurance provisions for one year if they are above 18 years of age and less than 65 years of age. This negatively impacts asylum seekers and refugees' health as it places a high financial burden on them and can result in delaying seeking medical treatment. The Ministry of Health (MoH) has established Migration Health Centers across Türkiye which provide primary healthcare services to increase preventative health. Arabic speaking translators have been deployed to public hospitals to help direct patients and provide translation, but the number of translators per hospital is low and other languages remain unaddressed. Based on Turkish law, emergency healthcare services are free, but refugees have faced difficulty accessing. Various efforts have been undertaken to strengthen the public healthcare system to provide services to refugees and asylum seekers. Specific efforts have been dedicated to increasing access to reproductive healthcare, vaccination for children and more recently a focus on chronic health issues (Sihhat-2). While existing efforts have contributed to strengthening and increasing the capacities of the public health sector some gaps persist. The following recommendations are organized around the pillars of facilitating access to healthcare, quality of care and sustainability:

³¹ Ayşegül Kayaoğlu, "A Youth Centered Participatory Assessment in Turkey: Understanding Refugee and Host Community Youth's Perceptions, Challenges and Needs" (Save the Children, 2021).

³² Fulya Memişoğlu, Altan Özkil & Tuna Kılınç, Protection Needs of Refugees with Disability, (IGAM, ARSA, SMDD, 2021).

³³ Ayşegül Kayaoğlu, "A Youth Centered Participatory Assessment in Turkey: Understanding Refugee and Host Community Youth's Perceptions, Challenges and Needs" (Save the Children, 2021). The report is based on quantitative and qualitative research including in-depth interviews and focus group discussions undertaken with Syrian and Turkish youth (aged 15-25) living in Istanbul in 2021.

- It is necessary to ensure that refugee and asylum seekers can access health regardless of their documentation or registration status.³⁴ It is necessary to re-institute and expand health insurance for asylum seekers and conditional refugees under International Protection beyond the current one-year limitation is a must to ensure public health,³⁵ especially for refugees with disability and those with chronic illness even if the illness is a pre-migratory condition.³⁶ Moreover, right to access healthcare should be maintained until a final decision on asylum seekers' asylum case are made to avoid interrupting treatment and negatively impacting health.³⁷ Addressing the legal/insurance barrier is a public health issue and affects refugee and asylum seekers' participation in education, labor market and the like.
- Language barriers continue to influence access to health. MoH in collaboration with CSOs should make interpretation and translation services in different languages including Farsi, Dari, Pashto among other languages available at different levels of the healthcare system. It is also recommended to diversify the methods used to provide translation or interpretation (e.g. telephone or online simultaneous translation services, etc.)³⁸
- More flexible healthcare support in the form mobile health units address the needs of diverse hard to reach and mobile refugee populations (e.g. seasonal agricultural laborers).³⁹
- Transportation emerges as a key factor affecting access to health. MoFSS, NGOs or local municipal authorities may consider developing schemes to either cover transportation costs for refugees with mobility needs (e.g. top up existing social support schemes) or develop transportation services at municipal level for citizens and refugees with special needs.⁴⁰ Through mobility schemes cost and difficulty of reaching health institutions would be reduced.
- HIV treatment should be considered alongside Tuberculosis and other life threatening and infectious illnesses and its treatment should be made free to access. It is also necessary to address specific stigma concerning HIV among hospital staff and the public.⁴¹
- MoH to provide free access to hormone and gender affirmation treatments and surgeries for refugees.⁴²
- Refugees with disabilities are dependent on disability reports to access social services, rehabilitation centers and the like. It is necessary for MoH to consider increasing the number

³⁴ Deniz Bozkuzu & Yusuf Nural, "Protection Monitoring Report II on Refugees Engaged in Seasonal Agricultural Labor in Gaziantep, Şanlıurfa, Adana and Mersin," (GOAL, August 2021); Zakire Hekmat, "Zorunlu Göç Farkındalığının Artırılması (FARK) Savunculuk Raporu," (TMK, ARSA, Hayata Destek, 2022).

³⁵ Aylin Kırıkçı, Ercan Aydın, Selçuk Çelik, Süleyman Sayar & Müzeyyen Araç, Report on Right to Health for LGBTI+ Refugees and Discrimination, (HEVI LGBTI+ Association, April 2021).

³⁶ Zakire Hekmat, "Zorunlu Göç Farkındalığının Artırılması (FARK) Savunculuk Raporu," (TMK, ARSA, Hayata Destek, 2022).

³⁷ Aylin Kırıkçı, Ercan Aydın, Selçuk Çelik, Süleyman Sayar & Müzeyyen Araç, Report on Right to Health for LGBTI+ Refugees and Discrimination, (HEVI LGBTI+ Association, April 2021).

³⁸ Fulya Memişoğlu, Altan Özkil & Tuna Kılınç, Protection Needs of Refugees with Disability, (İGAM, ARSA, SMDD, 2021).

³⁹ Deniz Bozkuzu & Yusuf Nural, "Protection Monitoring Report II on Refugees Engaged in Seasonal Agricultural Labor in Gaziantep, Şanlıurfa, Adana and Mersin," (GOAL, August 2021).

⁴⁰ Fulya Memişoğlu, Altan Özkil & Tuna Kılınç, Protection Needs of Refugees with Disability, (İGAM, ARSA, SMDD, 2021); SENED, "Protection and Education Needs of Refugees with Disabilities in Southeast Turkey," (SENEDE, 2022).

⁴¹ Aylin Kırıkçı, Ercan Aydın, Selçuk Çelik, Süleyman Sayar & Müzeyyen Araç, Report on Right to Health for LGBTI+ Refugees and Discrimination, HEVI LGBTI+ Association (April 2021).

⁴² Aylin Kırıkçı, Ercan Aydın, Selçuk Çelik, Süleyman Sayar & Müzeyyen Araç, Report on Right to Health for LGBTI+ Refugees and Discrimination, HEVI LGBTI+ Association (April 2021).

of hospitals providing Disability Reports or creating a fast-track system. Guidance and Research Centers (Rehberlik ve Araştırma Merkezleri [RAM]) play a pivotal role in facilitating access to rehabilitation services. Ensuring easier engagement through the recruitment of translators (e.g. Arabic, Farsi), increased outreach about the role of RAMs, RAM reports and processes to access rehabilitation and physical therapy services would contribute to improving health.⁴³

- Experiences of discrimination from healthcare professionals negatively affects health seeking practices. By developing redress mechanisms and training staff to deal with issues concerning discrimination against LGBTIQ+ refugees, refugees with disability or other segments of the refugee population, MoH would contribute to a zero tolerance for discrimination/racism.⁴⁴ In addition, it is necessary to provide refugees with mechanisms to report instances of discrimination in their native language. Public campaigns to address discrimination and xenophobia may contribute to improved experiences using healthcare services.

Mental Health Support

Psycho-social support for refugees and asylum seekers has diversified in recent years. NGOs and CSOs working with refugees continue to provide psycho-social support in person or via telephone. The Ministry of Health (MoH) has also initiated efforts to provide psycho-social support to refugees through Migrant Health Clinics (MHCs) and in Women's Centers, operated in coordination with national/local and refugee-led organizations and INGOs. Mental health continues to be an area of concern and the following recommendations have been made:

- Despite existing psycho-social support services offered to refugees and asylum seekers, further efforts are needed to expand, and customize psychosocial support to meet diverse refugees' needs (e.g. LGBTIQ+ refugees, female refugees, refugees with disability, their primary caregivers and family members, etc.).⁴⁵
- Expanding psychosocial support beyond counselling services to foster community networks that transcend citizenship or status thereby embedding social support mechanisms into the community and diversifying the forms of psychosocial support available⁴⁶

Covid-19 Vaccination

While the impact of the Covid-19 pandemic has been greatly reduced due ongoing vaccination campaigns and precautionary measures, it is still necessary to raise awareness about the importance of vaccination and following other preventative protocols to ensure the virus remains contained. Long Covid and the impact of the coronavirus on individuals with certain pre-existing or chronic conditions requires continued vigilance.

Recommendations:

⁴³ Fulya Memişoğlu, Altan Özkil & Tuna Kılınç, Protection Needs of Refugees with Disability, (İGAM, ARSA, SMDD, 2021); SENED, "Protection and Education Needs of Refugees with Disabilities in Southeast Turkey," (SENE, 2022).

⁴⁴ Aylin Kırıkçı, Ercan Aydın, Selçuk Çelik, Süleyman Sayar & Müzeyyen Araç, Report on Right to Health for LGBTIQ+ Refugees and Discrimination, (HEVI LGBTIQ+ Association, April 2021); SENED, "Protection and Education Needs of Refugees with Disabilities in Southeast Turkey," (SENE, 2022).

⁴⁵ Aylin Kırıkçı, Ercan Aydın, Selçuk Çelik, Süleyman Sayar & Müzeyyen Araç, Report on Right to Health for LGBTIQ+ Refugees and Discrimination, (HEVI LGBTIQ+ Association, April 2021); IOM, "Needs Assessment Report on Women Empowerment in Adana and Gaziantep," (IOM, February 2022).

⁴⁶ Fulya Memişoğlu, Altan Özkil & Tuna Kılınç, Protection Needs of Refugees with Disability, (İGAM, ARSA, SMDD, 2021); GK Consulting & CARE, "Syrian Refugee Women's Roles," (CARE, February 2020).

- Access to Covid-19 vaccines should be freely available to unregistered refugees and migrants; MoH to include these groups into the National Implementation Strategy for COVID-19 Vaccination as Covid-19 is a public health concern⁴⁷
- Although the general attitude is that the pandemic is over, the health impact of contracting the virus if unvaccinated or if the individual is considered high-risk (e.g. cancer patients, etc.), necessitates CSOs and local health directorates to raise awareness about the importance of Covid-19 vaccination and booster shots. Campaigns that are geared towards different refugee groups (e.g. different languages) and different segments within refugee populations (e.g. female refugees, nomadic/semi-nomadic groups, etc.) may contribute to increased uptake.⁴⁸

Achieving Food Security & Meeting Basic Needs

Various actors participate in ongoing programs to support refugee populations to achieve food security and meet basic needs. The largest programs, the Emergency Social Safety Net (ESSN) and the Complementary Emergency Social Safety Net (C-ESSN) exist alongside smaller food and non-food forms of assistance.⁴⁹ A recent IFRC and TRC longitudinal survey comparing ESSN beneficiaries' situations in the June-September 2020 period to their situation in May-September 2021 provides an overview of the impact of the Covid-19 pandemic on refugees' ability to secure their basic needs.⁵⁰ Based on the survey (n=3208), refugee ESSN beneficiaries experienced an overall increase in income after the lockdown period of the pandemic ended due to return to informal labor. **However, the rising prices in Türkiye meant the increase in income did not decrease their reliance on conditional cash transfers to meet their basic needs.** In addition, the survey notes an increased reliance on debt and changes in diet to meet basic needs.⁵¹ Based on existing studies, the following are key areas of recommendation:

Cash Assistance Programs

- Although cash assistance programs have been ongoing for several years, research indicates that there is still misinformation about the access to such assistance, its procedures and eligibility criteria especially among harder to reach or mobile populations. MoFSS and local actors should establish information centers or activate/expand existing ones to provide refugees with information about social support and services (including assistance), legal information, guidance on application procedures and support to apply.⁵²
- While ESSN and C-ESSN are viewed to cover the needs of a large proportion of refugees, it is necessary to identify and refer refugees who are in critical need, but still ineligible for those

⁴⁷ Aylin Kırıkçı, Ercan Aydın, Selçuk Çelik, Süleyman Sayar & Müzeyyen Araç, Report on Right to Health for LGBTI+ Refugees and Discrimination, (HEVI LGBTI+ Association, April 2021).

⁴⁸ Mavi Kalem Association, "Covid-19 Vaccine Attitude Analysis Research Report: Vaccine Attitude Analysis Research Report on Syrian Communities," (Mavi Kalem, 2021). The report is based on research conducted with Syrian refugees (n=455) relying on telephone interview. Deniz Bozkuzu & Yusuf Nural, "Protection Monitoring Report II on Refugees Engaged in Seasonal Agricultural Labor in Gaziantep, Şanlıurfa, Adana and Mersin," (GOAL, August 2021)ş Aylin Kırıkçı, Ercan Aydın, Selçuk Çelik, Süleyman Sayar & Müzeyyen Araç, Report on Right to Health for LGBTI+ Refugees and Discrimination, HEVI LGBTI+ Association (April 2021).

⁴⁹ UNHCR, "Turkey Basic Needs Sector Q3 Jan-September 2022" (UNHCR, September 2022).

⁵⁰ IFRC & TRC, "Deepening Poverty and Debt: Socioeconomic Impacts for Refugees in Turkey One Year on from Covid-19" (IFRC & TRC, December 2021).

⁵¹ IFRC & TRC, "Emergency Social Safety Net (ESSN) Programme: Spending and Trends in Coping Strategies," (IFRC & TRC, July 2022).

⁵² Zakire Hekmat, "Zorunlu Göç Farkındalığının Artırılması (FARK) Savunculuk Raporu," (TMK, ARSA, Hayata Destek, 2022).

programs, to other forms of support and follow up. It is also important to prioritize specific segments of refugee populations for cash assistance (e.g. refugees with disabilities or supported with additional/specific cash or in-kind assistance (e.g. refugees working as seasonal agricultural laborers)⁵³

- Research shows that the cash assistance programs support refugees to meet their basic needs but are insufficient to sustain households without at least one family member working may at times result in refugees relying on negative coping strategies.⁵⁴ Increasing the amount of support, focusing on formal labor integration or vocational training to enable refugees to access more secure employment may contribute to improving economic situations.

Shelter and Water, Sanitation and Hygiene (WASH)

Shelter and access to water, sanitation and hygiene (WASH) continue to be issues of concern especially for some segments of refugee populations more than others (e.g. seasonal agricultural laborers). Reports highlight that overcrowding of housing, discrimination against refugees in the rental sector and the new limitations on which neighborhood refugees can register their address are factors all influencing refugees' living conditions.⁵⁵ Based on reports, the following key recommendations are made:

- There is a need to develop a comprehensive strategic plan together with relevant ministries, NGOs and municipalities to support refugees' access to housing. A comprehensive shelter needs assessment for different refugee groups should be conducted to inform components of such a strategy.⁵⁶
- Cash-based mechanisms need to be developed to support refugees' access to shelter and the diversification and increased flexibility in cash-based interventions, especially given the rise in rents and the limitation on registration in certain districts. In addition, NGOs and community/information centers raise awareness among refugees about their legal rights as tenants.⁵⁷ Knowledge about legal recourse may contribute to reducing exploitative conditions.
- Specific segments of refugee populations such as refugees with disabilities require additional support to ensure their housing conditions are suitable. Local actors and CSOs need to coordinate and develop mechanisms to support refugees to find housing that meet their needs.⁵⁸
- Seasonal agricultural workers face difficult shelter conditions that require monitoring and the development of regulations. As most settlements are close to fields, it is necessary for CSOs, local and provincial actors to raise awareness among refugees working seasonal agricultural

⁵³ Deniz Bozkuzu & Yusuf Nural, "Protection Monitoring Report II on Refugees Engaged in Seasonal Agricultural Labor in Gaziantep, Şanlıurfa, Adana and Mersin," (GOAL, August 2021); Fulya Memişoğlu, Altan Özkil & Tuna Kılınc, Protection Needs of Refugees with Disability, (İGAM, ARSA, SMDD, 2021).

⁵⁴ IFRC & TRC, "Emergency Social Safety Net (ESSN) Programme: Spending and Trends in Coping Strategies," (IFRC & TRC, July 2022).

⁵⁵ Zakire Hekmat, "Zorunlu Göç Farkındalığının Artırılması (FARK) Savunculuk Raporu," (TMK, ARSA, Hayata Destek, 2022); Fulya Memişoğlu, Altan Özkil & Tuna Kılınc, Protection Needs of Refugees with Disability, (İGAM, ARSA, SMDD, 2021).

⁵⁶ Basic Needs Working Group, "BNWG Shelter Note: Refugees' Access to Shelter in Türkiye," (Inter-Agency Coordination Türkiye, July 2022).

⁵⁷ Ibid.; Refugee Council of Turkey, "Access to Education Report" (TMK, 2022).

⁵⁸ Fulya Memişoğlu, Altan Özkil & Tuna Kılınc, Protection Needs of Refugees with Disability, (İGAM, ARSA, SMDD, 2021).

labor and their employers about safe water storage, safe pesticide usage, waste management and basic first aid to improve basic living conditions.⁵⁹

Livelihood

The Regulation on Labor of Persons under Temporary Protection has been in operation since 2016. For asylum seekers applying for IP, their right to work is organized based on labor law 6735 issued in 2016. Based on the regulation, working in certain sectors (e.g. animal husbandry, seasonal agricultural work, etc.) does not require applying for a work permit. Many efforts have been undertaken since then to raise awareness about the work permit process and to increase refugees' access to formal labor markets. However, most refugees, Syrian and non-Syrian, continue to work informally which raises concerns about work conditions, labor rights, social security and the like. According to data from the Ministry of Labor, Family and Social Security (MoFSS) for 2020, 62,369 Syrian nationals, 1,921 Afghan nationals, 1,794 Iraqi nationals, 4,015 Iranian nationals and 508 Palestinian nationals hold work permits;⁶⁰ not all those with work permits are asylum applicants or under Temporary Protection status. In comparison to the number of refugees at work age, these figures remain low.

INGOs and NGOs have developed various vocational training programs, entrepreneurship support programs, among other initiatives to increase and improve refugees' labor integration. In many cases, these programs focus on a specific segment of the refugee population namely youth or women to address informal labor integration, labor market needs as well as addressing persistent vulnerabilities. İŞKUR, and NGO developed platforms/initiatives, have sought to match employers with refugee employees. The successes of these initiatives vary and informal employment and child labor persist.

ILO research among Syrian and Turkish youth living in urban areas showed that Syrian youth were more likely to work informally and work longer hours than their Turkish counterparts.⁶¹ Both groups were negatively affected by the pandemic and faced loss of employment. With respect to work conditions, Syrian youth prioritize salary level, working hours and health insurance rather than unemployment insurance or old-age pension. The research found that among those youth who experienced mistreatment in the workplace, the most common form of abuse was financial followed by neglect, emotional-psychological abuse, verbal abuse, age discrimination and gender-based discrimination.

Various research indicates key recommendations concerning livelihood including:

- Despite legal measures to increase formal employment of refugees, informal employment persists and with it exploitative and undignified work conditions. **One recommendation made is to establish labor support groups to monitor labor rights in workplaces and to coordinate with local bodies to improve labor laws and implementation.**⁶² Such an initiative may contribute to increasing the accountability of employers concerning workplace conditions or in instances of work accidents. At the policy level, it is necessary to revise and

⁵⁹ Deniz Bozkuzu & Yusuf Nural, "Protection Monitoring Report II on Refugees Engaged in Seasonal Agricultural Labor in Gaziantep, Şanlıurfa, Adana and Mersin," (GOAL, August 2021).

⁶⁰ Ministry of Labor, Family and Social Security, "Yabancıların Çalışma İzinleri [Work Permits of Foreigners]," (MoFSS, 2020).

⁶¹ ILO, "Youth employment in Turkey: Structural challenges and impact of the pandemic on Turkish and Syrian youth," (ILO, 2022). For the report a survey was conducted with 1800 respondents, (900) Syrian and (900) Turkish youth living across Turkey between 18-29 in November and December 2021. The survey findings were complemented with key informant interviews (n=19) conducted in December 2021.

⁶² Zakire Hekmat, "Zorunlu Göç Farkındalığının Artırılması (FARK) Savunculuk Raporu," (TMK, ARSA, Hayata Destek, 2022).

interrogate the discourse of ‘refugee self-reliance’ in the absence of widespread formal employment especially following crises such as the Covid-19 pandemic.⁶³

- **Various efforts to increase the labor participation of women must address fears of facing sexual harassment or discrimination in the workplace.** Advocacy to develop and implement laws to increase protection in the workplace may address these issues.⁶⁴
- Further efforts to map market needs, identify cooperation and partnership opportunities on livelihood issues, and employment opportunities in different provinces is needed. Mapping activities must then be complemented by developing vocational training programs in coordination with local actors based on local/provincial needs or companies thereby connecting trainees with employers. **Beyond market needs, various research highlights the need to facilitate women’s access to financial resources and other resources to support women entrepreneurs or potential entrepreneurs.**⁶⁵
- Language is identified as a barrier to formal labor participation and to women’s labor participation specifically. Existing efforts to support refugees’ Turkish language acquisition must be expanded by NGOs connecting refugees to NGOs and public institutions providing language courses. It is necessary to support refugees to continue to an advanced language level. **For women refugees, supporting their language acquisition requires covering the cost of transportation and childcare.**⁶⁶
- It is necessary to develop additional initiatives to support diverse segments of refugee populations to participate in the labor market. In the case of women, NGOs and local authorities can expand and diversify the types of vocational training offered to refugee women beyond socially acceptable professions (e.g. hairdresser, seamstress, etc.). It is also necessary to raise awareness among refugee households about the significance of women’s labor; this may contribute to countering negative attitudes and perceptions. NGOs to customize vocational education or entrepreneurship programs to facilitate the labor market integration of LGBTIQ+ refugees or refugees living with disability. Developing support for remote work for refugees may offer additional opportunities.⁶⁷

⁶³); Lülüfer Körükmez, “Women’s Labor in the Grip of Market, Policy and Gender,” (Kırkayak Kültür, December 2021). The qualitative research was conducted in Istanbul and Gaziantep with Syrian and Turkish women including interviews (n=36) and focus group discussions (total of 6 FGDs). Canan Uçar, Damla Deniz Cengiz, Emine Doğan Kaya, Fatma Coşkun Caymaz & Kemal Vural Tarlan, “The Voice of the Subject: Migrant Women’s Labor during the Pandemic Period,” (Kırkayak Kültür, December 2020). The report presents stories from refugee women collecting during the pandemic based on audio-visual interviews conducted with refugee women.

⁶⁴ Refugee Council Turkey (TMK), “Gender and Migration Working Group Notes,” (TMK, internal 20.04.2022).

⁶⁵ Zakire Hekmat, “Zorunlu Göç Farkındalığının Artırılması (FARK) Savunculuk Raporu,” (TMK, ARSA, Hayata Destek, 2022); IOM, “Needs Assessment Report on Women Empowerment in Adana and Gaziantep,” (IOM, February 2022).

⁶⁶ Refugee Council Turkey (TMK), “Gender and Migration Working Group Notes,” (TMK, internal 20.04.2022); IOM, “Needs Assessment Report on Women Empowerment in Adana and Gaziantep,” (IOM, February 2022); Deniz Bozkuzu & Yusuf Nural, “Protection Monitoring Report II on Refugees Engaged in Seasonal Agricultural Labor in Gaziantep, Şanlıurfa, Adana and Mersin,” (GOAL, August 2021)

⁶⁷ Refugee Council Turkey (TMK), “Gender and Migration Working Group Notes,” (TMK, internal 20.04.2022); Zakire Hekmat, “Zorunlu Göç Farkındalığının Artırılması (FARK) Savunculuk Raporu,” (TMK, ARSA, Hayata Destek, 2022); Orange, “Community Profiling and Labor Market Assessment and Mapping of Hatay, Kahramanmaraş, Kilis and Şanlıurfa: Key Findings Report,” (Orange, August 2021); Aylin Kırıkçı, Ercan Aydın, Selçuk Çelik, Süleyman Sayar & Müzeyyen Araç, Report on Right to Health for LGBTIQ+ Refugees and Discrimination, (HEVI LGBTIQ+ Association, April 2021); Lülüfer Körükmez, “Women’s Labor in the Grip of Market, Policy and Gender,” (Kırkayak Kültür, December 2021).

Social Cohesion & Involving Refugees in Decision Making Processes

Based on existing research, countering polarization and discrimination against refugees is one of the main challenges currently faced. Discrimination and xenophobia negatively impact refugees' social relations, experiences in education, healthcare and the labor market. Countering negative attitudes and perceptions among host community requires a multi-level approach and it is essential to decrease social tensions. Moreover, NGOs and local actors working on social cohesion issues must consider intersectional forms of discrimination experienced in the case of Syrian Roma refugee groups or LGBTIQ+ refugees.⁶⁸ **Developing strategies based on the simple binary of host and refugee community will fail to address intersectional dimensions.** Some initiatives and programs have been designed to address discrimination issues; however, a more consistent, deliberate, long term, multi-leveled and cross sectoral approach is needed to fight discrimination against refugees and specifically marginal groups. Research highlights the following key recommendations which must be considered together:

- Conduct studies in different provinces to understand local context and how integration can be achieved based on local variables. Based on study findings develop multi-level communication campaigns targeting different levels of local communities through collaboration with muhtars, schools, municipalities and universities.⁶⁹ The localization of campaigns, involvement of different actors among the host community may contribute to increasing acceptance of these communication messages.
- Local actors and NGOs to organize community activities bringing host and refugee youth together such as sport or arts to provide space for positive interaction and engagement. In addition, CSOs and local actors to celebrate the work of refugee artists or collaborations between host and refugee artists to highlight refugee voices.⁷⁰
- Cases of successful co-existence present possibility to share good practices and require creating a platform to share knowledge⁷¹
- CSOs working on refugee issues and those working with people living with disability must connect to foster social support networks for refugees and citizens with disability and their families to develop social support networks.⁷² Disability is an issue that extends beyond citizenship lines and it is important to develop complementary efforts among NGOs working on these issues.
- CSOs to develop and provide information sessions on integration for different refugee groups in their native language.⁷³

⁶⁸ Nehir Gündoğdu, Fatma Coşkun Caymaz, Zühal Gezici & Kemal Vural Tarlan, "Being educated is a distant dream to us.' Dom and Abdal Children's Education in Turkey: The Cases of Gaziantep and Şanlıurfa," (Kırkayak Kültür, August 2020).

⁶⁹ Zakire Hekmat, "Zorunlu Göç Farkındalığının Artırılması (FARK) Savunculuk Raporu," (TMK, ARSA, Hayata Destek, 2022).

⁷⁰ Aysegül Kayaoglu, "A Youth Centered Participatory Assessment in Turkey: Understanding Refugee and Host Community Youth's Perceptions, Challenges and Needs" (Save the Children, 2021); Zakire Hekmat, "Zorunlu Göç Farkındalığının Artırılması (FARK) Savunculuk Raporu," (TMK, ARSA, Hayata Destek, 2022).

⁷¹ Zakire Hekmat, "Zorunlu Göç Farkındalığının Artırılması (FARK) Savunculuk Raporu," (TMK, ARSA, Hayata Destek, 2022).

⁷² Fulya Memişoğlu, Altan Özkil & Tuna Kılıncı, Protection Needs of Refugees with Disability, (İGAM, ARSA, SMDD, 2021).

⁷³ Zakire Hekmat, "Zorunlu Göç Farkındalığının Artırılması (FARK) Savunculuk Raporu," (TMK, ARSA, Hayata Destek, 2022).

- Local actors establishing refugee committees at neighborhood level with women refugee members to give refugee women a role and voice in local decision-making processes concerning activities and to facilitate information dissemination about access to services.⁷⁴
- Establishing, or if existent activating, peer mediation and conflict resolution committees with refugee students in schools.⁷⁵ This approach would help to counter issues of belonging as it would assign refugee students responsibility and promote mediation to solve conflicts supporting more inclusive school environments.

Conclusion

The synthesis of reports and needs assessments focusing on refugee issues for the period under review provides an overview of key persistent gaps where further efforts and actions are required. Pivotal issues that must be addressed in the coming years are primarily protection, social cohesion and fighting discrimination and financial support to decrease the impact of the worsening economic situation.

Placing various recommendations from INGO and NGO in the same frame brings to the fore that a baseline of service provision and inclusion is in operation, but various gaps continue, and different segments of refugee populations face persistent barriers or are excluded. The model of supporting and strengthening public institutions is effective in extending access to services and reducing pressure on service providers, but tackling continued gaps or barriers requires diversifying the strategies adopted. **This coming phase requires refining and customizing many of the strategies and mechanisms relied on to meet refugee needs based on local actors' experiences, their capacities and a recognition of diverse refugee needs.** While discourse of 'one size does not fit all' in humanitarian or refugee aid is not new or innovative per se, it is necessary to reiterate it for various actors involved to consider the heterogeneity within and across refugee populations and for developing programs that can meet these needs in a comprehensive manner.

In a similar argument made with respect to protection,⁷⁶ reviewing existing discussions on social cohesion and fighting discrimination highlights a difference in priorities between INGOs and national NGOs or refugee-led organizations. Where the latter emphasize the role of local community actors such as mukhtars or educators focusing on the everyday and local level, the former concentrate more on advocacy, awareness raising and strengthening the capacities of different institutions. While capacity building (e.g. schools) would contribute to addressing this issue, it is insufficient given the need for strategies crossing across society /social and administrative levels and long-term perspective. Here the role of local NGOs and refugee-led organizations is key in developing effective complex and multi-pronged approaches to fight discrimination and xenophobia. Such processes should rely on recognition of local actors as full partners in refugee support efforts and their accumulative experience and expertise. It also requires understanding that INGOs cannot lead or set the agenda on these issues, necessitating national NGOs or refugee-led NGOs to determine priorities.

⁷⁴ Ibid.,

⁷⁵ Serhat Çelik, "Understanding School Dropouts Among Refugee Children: Barriers, Challenges and Opportunities in the Case of Esenyurt, Istanbul, (Save the Children, January 2022).

⁷⁶ See Amanda Gray Meral, Mia Tong, Josephine Whitaker-Yilmaz, Turker Saliji, Ceren Topgül & Mer yem Aslan, "Refugee advocacy in Turkey from Local to Global," (HPG Working Paper, September 2021).

Resources

Aşık, Güneş A. (March 2022), *Analysis of Measures to Increase the Labor Force Participation of Refugee and Turkish Women in Turkey*. Refugee of Council Turkey (TMK).

Evcil, Gülbahar C.. (July 2022). *2022 Yılı I. 6 Aylık Kadın Danışma Merkezi Raporu*. Mardin Ortak Kadın İşbirliği Derneği. (<https://mokid.org/raporlar/>)

Basic Needs Working Group. (July 2022). *BNWG Shelter Note: Refugees' Access to Shelter in Türkiye*. Inter-Agency Coordination Türkiye. (<https://data.unhcr.org/en/documents/details/94325>)

Bozkuzu, Deniz & Nural, Yusuf. (August 2021). *Protection Monitoring Report II on Refugees Engaged in Seasonal Agricultural Labor in Gaziantep, Şanlıurfa, Adana and Mersin*. GOAL. (<https://data.unhcr.org/en/needs-assessment/1525>)

GK Consulting & CARE. (February 2020). *Syrian Refugee Women's Roles*. CARE. (https://www.care-international.org/files/files/Syrian_Refugee_Women_Roles_25_02_2020.pdf)

Çelik, Serhat. (January 2022). *Understanding School Dropouts Among Refugee Children: Barriers, Challenges and Opportunities in the Case of Esenyurt, Istanbul*. Save the Children. (<https://resourcecentre.savethechildren.net/document/understanding-school-drop-outs-among-refugee-children-barriers-challenges-and-opportunities-in-the-case-of-esenyurt-istanbul/>)

Gray Meral, A., Tong, M., Whitaker-Yılmaz, J., Saliji, T., Topgül, C. and Aslan, M. (2021) *Refugee advocacy in Turkey: from local to global*. HPG working paper. London: ODI (<https://odi.org/en/publications/refugee-advocacy-in-turkey-from-local-to-global>).

Gündoğdu, Nehir, Coşkun Caymaz, Fatma, Gezici, Zühal & Tarlan, Kemal Vural. (August 2020). *'Being educated is a distant dream to us.' Dom and Abdal Children's Education in Turkey: The Cases of Gaziantep and Şanlıurfa*. Kırıkayak Kültür. (<http://www.kirkayak.org/publications/>)

Hekmat, Zakire. (2022). *Zorunlu Göç Farkındalığının Artırılması (FARK) Savunculuk Raporu*. TMK, ARSA & Hayata Destek. (<https://arsa.org.tr/TR/-zorunlu-goc-farkindaliginin-artirilmasifark-raporu-yayinlandi>)

Hayata Boyu Öğrenmeli Genek Müdürlüğü. (2022). *İzleme ve Değerlendirme Raporu 2021*. MEB. (<http://hbogm.meb.gov.tr/www/izleme-degerlendirme-raporlari/kategori/104>)

IFRC & TRC. (December 2021). *Deepening Poverty and Debt: Socioeconomic Impacts for Refugees in Turkey One Year on from Covid-19*. IFRC & TRC. (https://www.ifrc.org/sites/default/files/2021-12/socioeconomic_impacts_for_refugees_in_turkey_one_year_on_from_covid-19_0.pdf)

IFRC & TRC. (July 2022). *Emergency Social Safety Net (ESSN) Programme: Spending and Trends in Coping Strategies*. IFRC & TRC. (<https://reliefweb.int/report/turkiye/emergency-social-safety-net-essn-spending-and-trends-coping-strategies>)

ILO (2022). *Youth employment in Turkey: Structural challenges and impact of the pandemic on Turkish and Syrian youth*. ILO. (https://www.ilo.org/ankara/publications/WCMS_849561/lang--en/index.htm)

IOM,(February 2022). *Needs Assessment Report on Women Empowerment in Adana and Gaziantep*. IOM (<https://data.unhcr.org/en/documents/details/91418>)

Kayağlı, Ayşegül. (2021). *A Youth Centered Participatory Assessment in Turkey: Understanding Refugee and Host Community Youth's Perceptions, Challenges and Needs*. Save the Children.

(<https://resourcecentre.savethechildren.net/document/a-youth-centered-participatory-assessment-in-turkey-understanding-refugee-and-host-community-youths-perceptions-challenges-and-needs/>)

Kayağlu, Ayşegül. (February 2021). *Gender-Sensitive Study on Urban Child Labor in Istanbul*. Save the Children.

(<https://resourcecentre.savethechildren.net/document/gender-sensitive-study-urban-child-labour-istanbul/>)

Kırıkçı, Aylin, Aydın, Ercan, Çelik, Selçuk, Sayar, Süleyman & Araç, Müzeyyen. (April 2021). *Report on Right to Health for LGBTIQ+ Refugees and Discrimination*. HEVI LGBTIQ+ Association. (https://www.stgm.org.tr/sites/default/files/2021-05/multeci-LGBTIQ+-saglik-hakki-ve-ayrimcilik-raporu-ingilizce_dijital-1.pdf)

Körükmez, Lülüfer. (December 2021). *Women's Labor in the Grip of Market, Policy and Gender*.

Kirkayak Kültür. (<http://www.kirkayak.org/publications/>)

Mavi Kalem Association. (2021). *Covid-19 Vaccine Attitude Analysis Research Report: Vaccine Attitude Analysis Research Report on Syrian Communities*. Mavi Kalem.

(<https://www.mavikalem.org/en/2022/06/24/newsletter-june-2022-covid-19-vaccine-attitude-analysis-is-published/>)

Memişoğlu, Fulya, Özkil, Altan & Kılınc, Tuna. (2021). *Protection Needs of Refugees with Disability*. İGAM, ARSA, SMDD. (<https://igamder.org/EN/-4798>)

Orange. (August 2021). *Community Profiling and Labor Market Assessment and Mapping of Hatay, Kahramanmaraş, Kilis and Şanlıurfa: Key Findings Report*. Orange.

SENEDE. (2022). *Protection and Education Needs of Refugees with Disabilities in Southeast Turkey*, SENED. (<https://data.unhcr.org/en/documents/details/95208>)

Presidency for Migration Management (PMM). (2022). Statistics. (<https://www.goc.gov.tr/uluslararasi-koruma-istatistikler>)

Refugee Council of Turkey (TMK). (2022). *Access to Education Report*. TMK.

Uçar, Canan, Cengiz, Damla D., Doğan Kaya, Emine, Coşkun Caymaz, Fatma & Tarlan, Kemal Vural, (December 2020). *The Voice of the Subject: Migrant Women's Labor during the Pandemic Period*. Kirkayak Kültür. (<http://www.kirkayak.org/publications/>)

UNICEF. (August 2022). *Conditional Cash Transfer for Education (CCTE) Programme for Syrians and Other Refugees, August Factsheet*. UNICEF.

(<https://www.unicef.org/turkiye/en/conditional-cash-transfer-education-ccte-programme>)

UNHCR (September 2022). *Turkey Basic Needs Sector Q3 Jan-September 2022*. UNHCR.

(<https://data.unhcr.org/en/documents/details/96495>)